

Clashindarroch Wind Farm Proposals

Open Meeting

18th November, 2004

Questions

Bearing in mind the significant flooding experienced in Forres & Elgin, as a result of wide scale clearance of high ground of forests, has a study been carried out into the potential flooding (of the Deveron/Bogie) from the proposed clearance on the Clash? Many houses have been destroyed by flooding in Moray & are now uninsurable & unsaleable. (Andrew Snowball)

AMEC: No, study has been done on this. It ties in with the impact on the river. Discussions are ongoing.

How do AMEC propose to connect from the windmills to the national grid - going underground or building more pylons on the landscape?

AMEC: All the turbines will be connected by underground to a sub station in an area of trees on A920 on the corner near the turn off to the Edinglassie Rd. & will be screened. Footprint about 90m x 30m.

What might be done now to start a dialogue with AMEC re the water:

AMEC: A positive idea of Bob to get together as a community.

AMEC will distribute a paper about the access route and the hydrology.

How will these massive lorries get up a single track without considerable destruction to the road itself, road verges and some of the woodland along the way?

AMEC: there will be a one way system. As Jim Craig said, there would be a traffic management system in place. We will prepare a sheet on it.

The proposed wind turbines only last 25 years, Is there a plan for decommissioning?

AMEC: Legal document Section 75 lists what will have to be adhered to (whether it is AMEC or another company in the future), including the cost of decommissioning. A bond is held to cover this in case of sale. The concrete will stay.

AMEC claim that the Clash wind farm will power 53,000 homes. Can they please explain how they arrive at this figure? What do they anticipate the average power consumption per home to be?

AMEC: It is worked out by the average consumption per household and wind farm working 30% efficiency. Information on this will be given in the paper. (to be sent). Will be on the British Wind Energy website - on the amount of wind energy required over a given time.

With regard to the Environmental Impact Assessment in respect of mammals, is a survey of nearly 700 hectares that took 9 man days in January adequate to establish the presence or not of these animals, especially as much of it is fairly impenetrable forest?

AMEC: 10 new species were discovered, including Scottish wild cat.

Some areas are too windy for a wind farm. How do you know this is not the case here?

AMEC: The 2 monitor masts show is a good site.

Ploughing for forestry up and down caused the flooding. Building an access road should not do so. (J. Simpson)

This is an enormous engineering project, not just ploughing for forestry. Where will the community get information to ensure that the job is done well? In the borders there are examples of contractors being prosecuted, where they had had assurances that things were not going to go wrong and they did. The contractors just say sorry and pay the fine. Had asked AMEC for assurance about the safety of their spring water supply for Succoth. Got assurances would hear soon. Has heard nothing in 2 yrs. (Dr. D. MacKay).

What are the conditions the council requested be met on our behalf?

Joanna Strathdee:

- work to begin 5 yrs. from date of permission
- in 25 yrs. Turbines be dismantled & removed - ground be restored

- if fails in 6 months, all will be removed
- within 2 yrs. A fully detailed plan for re-instatement of planting
- stored turf and seed mix to be in conjunction with SNH
- wind turbine cement base to be fully buried
- all on site activities to be able to continue

30 conditions in all - can be seen on our new web site on: www.glassclash.info or from Joanna Strathdee or e-mail from Anne Forbes

What pressure can we apply as a community that will increase the likelihood of a Public Enquiry? (Tom Ingleby)
Joanna Strathdee: Can't answer that. It is up to the Scottish Executive.

Given that a conglomerate such as AMEC seems to be able to ride roughshod over small communities such as ours, what makes Bob so sure that we would have any entitlement to vast sums of compensatory cash?

Bob: The Executive is very keen to listen to the community. More chance of achieving what we want if we act collectively in addressing AMEC, the installers and the Scottish Executive.

Bob, you propose a 'Co-op for benefit of the community'. A formal constitution for such a group is critical - is that something which can be readily obtained or do you see that as a significant first duty? (David Foubister)

Bob Yuill: Co-ops UK in Manchester have model rules available, giving support for communities like ourselves. Costs about £600-£700 to set up. Legal framework needs to be robust. Can bet that AMEC will not be the final owner. Will change hands. Grampian Enterprise has done nothing to help.

Questions not asked at the meeting due to shortage of time

For AMEC

Who owns the wind farms at the end of the day - the contractors, The Scottish Executive, Scottish Power, or the Government? - and how can the community group extract cash from the profits of the owners and be guaranteed compensation in the future? (John Hill)

Why do they think that load factor will be 35% when Denmark only manages 24% - 20% of which they have to export (cheaply) as it is produced when it is not required?

Why use the Deveron side for access when roads for HGV already exist?

What is to prevent AMEC/Scottish Exec. Using this Grummack access road as a Trojan Horse for additional wind turbines (this access road will go further than the centre of the complex. Would the Gordon's burn road not be adequate for 47 turbines?

How will the integrity of the private water supplies be guaranteed from: a) physical damage b) pollution, together with verges, track ways and personal wayside parking bays?

Why is there such a large disparity between the 2 EIA surveys?

Why are we trying to replace one renewable resource i.e. a large volume of utilisable timber, by another? Surely the windmills should be sited on fields or near industrial areas where they will have no impact on a superb landscape?

For Councillor Strathdee

West Denmark has massive wind power investment and strong winds, but less than 4% of its power comes from wind. Does it matter? (Vicky Spencer)

For Alan Cherry

Are you saying climate global change is not a reality? What are the costs of different power generation systems?

For Malcolm Hay

Sharing your concern for water quality in the process of building roads in the forest, does Mr. Hay believe that the conditions and practices as described in Forests & Water Guidelines and used locally do not safeguard the

rivers? Over 110 of roads have been built in the Clashindarroch Forest. (Norman Davidson, Forestry Commission).

For Bob Yuill

As those suffering from 'fuel poverty' (10 times those killed on the road) are going to be funding the wind farm, why not put proceeds into a charitable fund to help them?

What do you think of building energy efficient low cost rentable housing in Glass, rents to go into the community fund?